So, What’s Next?: An Analysis of Expert Proposals on How to Help Haiti Move Forward

By: Christina Prinvil
Research & Advocacy
OBJECTIVE

Make a Difference

Literature Review
Read, summarize, and present

Thematic Summaries
The goal is to take all the literature and to condense it into summaries that point to feasible solutions
LITERATURE REVIEW

- Distinguishes types of literature from op-eds to congressional reports
- Analyzes the solutions provided and the gaps in the literature
- Governance, Short-term Security, and Economy
WHAT DOES THE RESEARCH SAY?

- There Must Be a National Dialogue
- Montana Accord
- Support For the National Police
- Build Back Better Concept
- Foreign Intervention
- Global Fragility Act
- Other Policy Around the Crisis
There Must Be A National Dialogue
WHAT DOES A NATIONAL DIALOGUE LOOK LIKE?

GFA Coalition’s Workstream on Haiti Proposes

1. States Montana Accord’s Preamble should be utilized as a starting point
   • Also proposed by Monique Clesca, Cécile Accilien

2. Should Include Ariel and Members of Montana
   • “Any dialogue should include both the government of interim Prime Minister Ariel Henry and members of the Montana Accord, and a broad-based civil society-led coalition”
   • Also proposed by Georges Fauriol

3. International Financial Support: U.S. SHOULD provide funding
   • James Foley adds: U.S. Should spare no cost in helping Haiti.
   • Mass migration will only increase
MONTANA ACCORD: NECESSARY ELEMENTS NEEDED FOR IT TO BE TAKEN SERIOUSLY

International Community Needs to Respect Haiti’s Sovereignty

- “If the international community respectfully, openly and honestly supported these proposals from Haitian civil society with no strings attached, Haitians in Haiti and the diaspora (which economically contributes to over half of the country’s GNP through remittances) could begin a national dialogue to address this layered crisis that includes security, political, economic and climate issues.” (Accilien, 2022)

Should Include Henry and Haitian Civil Society

- “The best hope for an agreement would likely involve a power-sharing deal between Henry and those willing to see him in some future transitional government.” (Crisis group, 2022)
- Suggesting that if this becomes a reality Haiti civil society should take the opportunity
• Underestimates the power of gangs
  
  • “Montana leaders profess that a new government formed under their blueprint will enjoy an aura of unique legitimacy that will somehow overawe the criminal gangs and their financiers. This ignores both the firepower of the gangs and the degree to which they may now operate autonomously, a power unto themselves” (Foley, 2022)

• Can’t work without three essential Interlocking Elements
  
  • It requires an all-out diplomatic effort by the administration and comprises three interlocking elements. First, agreement among Haitians to forge a transitional government on the basis of the Montana Accord. Second, agreement by the prospective new government to support an international security mission to assist the Haitian National Police. Third, U.S. participation in the international force, without which it will lack credibility — and without which U.S. efforts to secure a political agreement will have little chance of success.
SUPPORT FOR THE PNH: BASED ON THEM DOING IT ALONE

**Special Unit**
- “A comprehensive vetting of special units directly involved in combating gangs is indispensable” (Crisis Group, 2022)
- “A specialised judicial unit devoted to tackling high-level corruption and politician malfeasance”

**Reinforcing the PNH**
- “In the short run, this means providing the HNP with the equipment, firepower, intelligence and technical advice needed to overpower the gangs currently holding the country and its economy hostage” (Foley, 2022)
- “It also means putting in place a robust vetting process to root out bad cops, and recruit Haitians committed to upholding the rule of law.”
**SUPPORT FOR PNH: BASED ON THEM DOING IT ALONE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trainings</th>
<th>Involve the Community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• “PNH training on human rights could be conducted in public or carried out with community participation such as through simulations” (Page, 2022)</td>
<td>• “Community programs that address trauma and promote healing should be developed” (Page, 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Material and financial assistance should in turn be accompanied by training programs in anti-gang and community-oriented policing techniques” (Crisis Group, 2022)</td>
<td>• “Haitian-led grassroots programs aimed at keeping young people out of gangs and providing them with incentives to leave as well as economic and other support once they are out” (Page, 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Kenya’s delegate, Martin Kimani, taken by countries who can relate to what’s going on in Haiti</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUPPORTING PNH IS NOT ENOUGH: HERE ARE SUGGESTIONS

(Inter-American Peace Force) (Senator Bill Cassidy R-LA.)

- Believes it should be comprised of willing countries like Chile and Brazil
- Believes U.S. should not send troops but should support training, logistics, and funding repurposed from USAID and State Department aid programs in Haiti
- Multilateral force modeled after the mission Johnson administration sent to DR in April of 1965

International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Affairs (INL) Program

- “well-funded INL program involves U.S. police trainers advising, mentoring, and coaching the PNH, though they do not accompany the PNH on missions” (Page, 2022)

Resolotion 2645(2022)

- “Emphasizing the importance of empowering BINUH (UNITED NATIONS INTEGRATED OFFICE IN HAITI) to carry out its good offices role, to engage all sectors of Haitian society, in particular political actors, civil society, women and religious leaders, including communities living in areas controlled by gangs, in support of political consensus, as well as in the necessary reforms to scale up advisory police support to the Haitian National Police (HNP) and re-open police commissariats in response to armed gang violence”
Many other member states feel the same way

France has reiterated the same sentiments

"BINUH is fundamental in supporting Haiti to resolve these multifaceted challenges." (UK, Alice Jacobs)

"Improving security support for the efforts of the Haitian National Police will enable it to combat the high levels of violence, as stipulated in paragraph 10 of resolution 2645 (2022)"

UNODC there to support national police
BUILD BACK BETTER CONCEPT
Worldwatch Institute posted a report highlighting lessons to be learned

"Their report adds, "Good recovery must reduce risks and build resilience in communities... [and] local governments must be empowered to manage recovery efforts, and donors must devote greater resources to strengthening government recovery institutions."

After the earthquake, the term build back better was reiterated a lot, but no one seemed to heed the lessons learned from South Asia.
WHAT IS REQUIRED?

Investing massively in social programs and youth development
• Examples: “Fos Jenes” and “Fos Payzan”

“Requires a baseline engagement from Haitian institutions and capabilities at all levels” (Fauriol, 2022)

Assembling support from Haitian businesses, the country’s large diaspora and foreign donors for a program to kickstart economic growth and generate jobs

Reframing Haiti’s Image

Localization
In 2013, Saulo Araujo argued that before Haiti can implement a “Build Back Better” Concept the international world must change its image of Haiti:

- “Haiti needs to be respected as a sovereign nation.”
- “Much of the impetus behind the massive influx of foreign aid into Haiti stems from the image of a failed nation, incapable taking care of its own people.”
• Today, sentiments of this notion of reframing Haiti’s image remains.
• In Tanvi Nagpal’s Op-ed on Why localization is the only way forward in Haiti he argues that the U.S. and donors must “change the narrative” on the capacity of local groups
  • “The U.S. continues to play an oversize role in Haitian politics and mistrust of its intentions runs deep.”
• He suggests the need to “support effective institutions, not projects”
• **Accompaniment in Crisis**
  • partnership
FOREIGN INTERVENTION

FOREIGN INTERVENTION

FOREIGN INTERVENTION

FOREIGN INTERVENTION
FOREIGN INTERVENTION AS A BARRIER TO BUILD BACK BETTER

• Haitians do not need more conditioned loans and sweatshops,” explains Mario Joseph. “If the international community really wants to help, they should stop interfering in our democracy and investing in jobs that inhibit our self-sufficiency and fail to give back to the community.”

(IJDH, 2022)
FOR OR AGAINST FOREIGN INTERVENTION?

- Sentiments on foreign intervention is very mixed
- Some believe that foreign intervention may be required to “break the gangs’ grip” (Crisis Group, 2022)
- “A number of Port-au-Prince residents defended the proposal for a foreign force out of a growing sense of hopelessness”
- “Support for a foreign deployment seems particularly high in areas worst afflicted by gang violence” (Crisis Group, 2022)
- “Inhabitants of Cité Soleil and other gang-controlled areas also betrayed a streak of impatience with political elites who oppose foreign troops: “The people who speak out against armed intervention, you have to see what their social status is and where they live. In these areas [under gang control], they prefer an intervention that would be far from perfect, but which would at least allow some security”.”
FOR OR AGAINST FOREIGN INTERVENTION?

- “International interventions and occupations have never fostered stability in Haiti.” (Accilien, 2022)
- “Arrival of international forces would enable Henry to reinforce what they see as his illegitimate grip on power”
- “Even putting it on the table appears to be serving the interests of those seeking to prop up an inherently unsustainable status quo” (Johnston, 2022)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GFA Coalition’s Workstream on Haiti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Include evidence-based analysis: suggests that this should be done instead of intervention. Must be ongoing and iterative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>should conduct a political economy and power analysis to better understand how violence is used to exert, maintain, or obtain influence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change norms and behavior related to violence: suggests that violence prevention programs be implemented by local organizations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GLOBAL FRAGILITY ACT (GFA)
GLOBAL FRAGILITY ACT

Goal: “Stabilize conflict-affected areas and prevent violence globally”

• Benefits:

• United States can vastly increase the infusion of capital into Haiti (Fauriol, Hakim, Ter Horst, & Mines, 2022)

• “A more targeted form of international assistance through the GFA, with Haitians playing the principal role, should help to refocus U.S. attention on Haitian aspirations and lead to the emergence of a more stable and democratic Haiti” (Page, 2022)

• Provides long-term solution
G.F.A: WHAT IS NECESSARY FOR IT TO SUCCEED?

Inclusion of Gang Leaders

- “Without giving too much up in the long-term, any political process will need to cautiously involve gang leaders — with clear, predetermined parameters” (Fauriol, Hakim, Ter Horst, & Mines, 2022)
- Clear, predetermined parameters and transparency mechanisms to avoid the perception of secret negotiations (GFA Coalition’s Haiti Workstream)

Must Lead to Credible Elections

- “Haiti’s most immediate needs are for political negotiations leading to credible elections and constitutional reform, basic security, and humanitarian aid.” (GFA Coalition’s Haiti Workstream)
G.F.A: WHAT IS NECESSARY FOR IT TO SUCCEED?

Nomination of a Haitian Representative

- That policy (GFA) shift will also have to include speeding up the process of nominating and confirming a high-caliber U.S. ambassador to Haiti (Fauriol, 2022).
- Appoint a Special Coordinator to oversee interagency activities in Haiti (GFA Coalition’s Haiti Workstream).

Must Focus on Haitian Priorities

- Full development of Haitian society—including women (Page, 2022)
- Anchored in Haitian priorities to revitalize Haiti’s economy and infrastructure.
- “the United States should focus on enhancing partnerships and leveraging actions and mandates of regional and international organizations such as CARICOM and the OAS”
SUGGESTION

OTHER POLICY AROUND THE CRISIS
“The Haiti Criminal Collusion Transparency Act of 2022 would require the U.S. Department of State to investigate the nature of the relationship between criminal gangs and political and economic elites in Haiti, and to submit an annual report to Congress on that topic.” (Val Demings)

Gaps:
- This has been tried before
- What will be done with the report?
- How much time and money will be dedicated to this?
MY CLOSING REMARKS BASED OFF THE REVIEW (OPINIONATED)

• Although the economy plays a huge role in terms of where Haiti is today, there is a lack of literature addressing economic programs and initiatives as solution
• No real solutions provided by the Haitian Caucus outside of Deming’s proposal
• The literature seems to overstate U.S. incentive in the matter
  • There needs to be more conversations on why getting involved should be appealing or not
• GFA workstream document overestimates incentive and has a lot of gaps but it has suggested the most tangible solutions that are practical.


• Foley, J. B. (2022, December 1). Opinion: I've seen military intervention in Haiti up close. we can't repeat the same mistakes. Politico. Retrieved from https://www.politico.com/news/magazine/2022/12/01/haiti-us-military-intervention-00071459


SOURCES

SOURCES


SOURCES


QUESTIONS AND CONCERNS

• Please feel free to email me with literature that you feel will fit into this project
• Email: Christinaprinvil@gmail.com